

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) **MISHNAH:** The Mishnah teaches that the megilla could be read from the eleventh to the fifteenth and details how the megilla could be read on the various days.

2) Reading on the eleventh, twelfth and thirteenth

The Gemara requests the source that indicates that the megilla could be read on the eleventh, twelfth and thirteenth.

R' Shemen bar Abba in the name of R' Yochanan cites a verse that indicates that there are many days on which the megilla could be read.

This source is unsuccessfully challenged.

R' Shmuel bar Nachmani cites an alternative source for this halacha.

This source is unsuccessfully challenged.

The Gemara explains why each Amora rejects the other's source.

3) Identifying the author of the Mishnah

Rabbah bar bar Chanah in the name of R' Yochanan states that the Mishnah follows the opinion of R' Akiva but Chachamim maintain that the megilla may only be read on the fourteenth and fifteenth.

R' Yochanan's statement is successfully challenged.

An alternative version of the previous discussion is presented and according to this second version the Baraisa supports R' Yochanan rather than refutes him.

4) Clarifying R' Yehudah's opinion

R' Ashi notes a contradiction between R' Yehudah's opinion as cited in the previous Baraisa and R' Yehudah's opinion as cited in a Mishnah and resolves the contradiction by attributing the Baraisa to R' Yosi bar Yehudah rather than R' Yehudah.

5) Cities surrounded by a wall from the time of Yehoshua ben Nun

The Gemara inquires after the source that cities surrounded by a wall from the time of Yehoshua ben Nun read on the fifteenth.

Rava identifies the verse that serves as the source for this halacha.

This source is unsuccessfully challenged.

It is noted that the Mishnah does not follow R' Yehoshua ben Korchah who maintains that cities surrounded by a wall from the time of Achashverosh read on the fifteenth.

The reason for each of the two positions is explained.

The reason each opinion disagrees with the other is explained.

(Continued on page 2)

Distinctive INSIGHT

*Are the varying dates for reading a violation of לא תתגודדו?
אלא שהכפרים מקדימים ליום הכניסה*

The system which the Mishna presents results in a wide variance of days for the mitzvah of reading the megilla. In any year, the people of the small towns will read the megilla on a Monday or Thursday, the larger towns will read it on the actual day of the fourteenth, and the walled cities will read it on the fifteenth. This leads Reish Lakish to ask Rav Yochanan (Gemara Yevamos 13b) why this is not in violation of the rule of לא תתגודדו, which warns us not to form into splinter groups. After presenting several cases where this rule may or may not apply, Rava finally explains that לא תתגודדו is a problem only when a single court in a city is split, with, for example, half ruling according to Beis Shammai, and half ruling according to Beis Hillel. However, we are not in violation of this law if we have two separate courts, even within one city, with one ruling according to Beis Shammai and the other ruling according to Beis Hillel. Rosh (ibid. #9) explains that when the members of the small towns gather and have the megilla read for themselves (by a member of the larger town) on the earlier date (11th, 12th, or 13th) and the residents of the city itself gather later on the 14th, this is comparable to a single court with split opinions, and it should be prohibited. Nevertheless, the reason there are varying days for reading is not that anyone disagrees with anyone else, but it is simply that the rules which apply to each town determine when they read. Any one person would actually adopt the other's date if he were to live in the other location. This proves that there is no element of dissension, but it is

(Continued on page 2)

REVIEW and Remember

1. What is the יום הכניסה?
2. According to R' Yehudah, why do villagers not read the megillah on an earlier date?
3. What is the source that walled cities read the megillah on the fifteenth?
4. What is the source that restricts Nevi'im from introducing new halachos?

HALACHAH Highlight

Reading the Megilla after plag hamincha

אמר קרא בזמניהם זמנו של זה לא זמנו של זה

The pasuk says, "In their proper times," [to teach] that the time for this one [walled cities] is not the same as the time for that one [unwalled cities.]

In the year 1947, during the period of the British Mandate, the British imposed a curfew on the residents of Yerushalayim prohibiting them from being out of their homes from evening until the morning. As Purim approached, the residents began to inquire about megilla reading. If people are not allowed out of their homes after dark how will they gather together in the Beis Haknesses for the community megilla reading? One suggested solution was to read the megilla in the afternoon after plag hamincha following a similar ruling by the Terumas HaDeshen¹.

One author² opposed the suggestion based on the statement of our Gemara. Our Gemara states that the reading of the megilla in walled cities must be on a different day than the reading of the megilla in unwalled cities. Therefore, even if we accept the lenient position of Terumas HaDeshen, it can not be utilized for the residents of a walled city because if the residents of the walled city read after plag hamincha on the fourteenth they will reading on the same day that the megilla was read for the unwalled cities thus violating the principle of our

(Overview. Continued from page 1)

R' Yehoshua ben Korchah's opinion is unsuccessfully challenged.

As an aside the Gemara clarifies how close a settlement must be to a walled city to qualify as "near."

6) Teachings from R' Yirmiyah or R' Chiya bar Abba

R' Yirmiyah or R' Chiya bar Abba teaches that the Nevi'im introduced the end letters (ך,ם,ו,ף,ץ).

The Gemara begins to mount a challenge to this statement. ■

Gemara. Rav Ovadiah Yosef³, however, disagrees with this conclusion. He writes that it is illogical to assert that reading after plag hamincha of the fourteenth for residents of a walled city should be any worse than reading after plag hamincha on the thirteenth which isn't even the time for the mitzvah. Since reading before the time for the mitzvah has arrived is acceptable, certainly residents of walled cities may read after plag hamincha on the fourteenth.

After a thorough and detailed analysis of the issue, Rav Ovadiah Yosef's conclusion was that in that case the megilla may be read in Yerushalayim on the fourteenth after plag hamincha and he permitted even the recitation of the beracha⁴. ■

1. שו"ת תרומת הדשן סע' ק"ט
2. הגר"י קלמס ומובא דבריו בס' המועדים בהלכה מהגרש"ו זיון עמ' קצ"ט
3. שו"ת יביע אומר ח"א או"ח סע' מ"ג אות כ'
4. שו"ת יביע אומר הנ"ל אות י"ז וכ' ■

STORIES Off the Daf

The Gezeira Shava of the walled cities

פרזי פרזי...מה להלן מוקפת חומה מימות יהושע בן נון

Rav Moshe Chaim Lau, shlit"א, writes that he would often visit the Pnei Menachem of Gur, zt"l, on Chol Hamod, because he always found it so inspiring. It was when the Pnei Menachim was still the Rosh Yeshiva of Yeshivas Sefas Emes.

On one occasion, they discussed one of the Gemaras on today's daf. The Rebbe remarked, "The Gemara learns that the language of the verse in the megillah, 'therefore the פרזי Jews' means the Jews who live in a city that had a wall from the time of Yehoshua bin Nun. The derivation is clearly a גזירה שוה of the same

term found in the verse in Devarim 3:5 which discusses the fact that Hashem had given many פרזי cities into our hands. Just as the verse in Devarim is discussing cities that were walled from the days of Yehoshua ben Nun, so too does the verse in the megillah according to the opinion of the Tanna of our Mishnah. Now how can the Tanna bring a גזירה שוה from the time of the megillah? The halachah is that one cannot make a גזירה שוה unless he received it from his Rebbe all the way back to Sinai!" (See Shabbos 97a and Tosafos there. See also Niddah 19b, that Rav Meir did judge a קל וחומר on his own. Also see Rashi, Sanhedrin 16a, ד"ה דבר (דבר ואין כאן מקום להאריך).

The Rebbe explained, "The truth is that the answer is obvious. The Gemara in Megillah 19b learns that Hashem told

the Jewish people about reading the megillah while they were still at Sinai. So the principle of reading Megillas Esther goes all the way back to the time of Moshe Rabbeinu, and that is why we have no trouble accepting that he received a גזירה שוה about it! ■

(Insight...Continued from page 1)

just the way the law is applied that changes the respective date of reading.

Rosh also suggests that perhaps the members of the small towns read for themselves on the earlier date (unlike Rashi, Megilla 2a, אל"ה (סד), and the city dwellers read for themselves on the fourteenth. This would then be compared to two courts within one city, with each conducting itself in a consistent manner, albeit differently than the other court. Here, the rule of לא תתגודדו does not apply. ■