

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) Instructions (cont.)

The advice Rav shared with different students as well as with his son is recorded.

The Gemara presents the statements of different Amoraim regarding brewing beer.

Business advice from R' Pappa as well as general pieces of advice are shared.

R' Yochanan identified three people who inherit the World-to-Come and three people whose piety is praised by Hashem on a daily basis.

The Gemara enumerates three people that Hashem loves and three people Hashem hates.

2) Witnessing someone acting immorally

An incident of Tuvia and Zigud is recorded.

A disagreement is presented concerning one who witnessed another commit an immoral act. According to R' Shmuel the son of R' Yitzchak in the name of Rav it is permitted to hate the sinner, whereas according to R' Nachman bar Yitzchak it is a mitzvah to hate him.

R' Ashi taught that one is permitted to tell his teacher that another committed an immoral act, if the teacher will believe him as strongly as two witnesses.

3) Threesomes and then some

Three Baraisos teaching something related to a threesome are presented.

The third Baraisa continues to teach lessons related to groups of four, five, six and seven.

Three teachings are taught in the name of Rabbah bar Channa in the name of R' Shmuel bar Marta in the name of Rav in the name of R' Yosi from Hutzal.

A Baraisa discusses the identity of R' Yosi from Hutzal as well as others. ■

REVIEW and Remember

1. Why did Rav teach his son Ayya the ways of the world?

2. What three people inherit the World-to-Come?

3. Under what circumstances is it permitted to hate another Jew?

4. What were the five lessons Canaan gave his son?

Distinctive INSIGHT

Torah study and support from communal funds

פשוט נבילתא בשוקא ושקיל אגרא ולא תימא כהנא אנא וגברא רבא אנא

Rambam (Hilchos Talmud Torah 3:10) writes that a person who studies Torah and does not earn a living, but rather suffices by collecting tzedakah, "disgraces the name of Hashem, diminishes the light of Torah, causes harm to himself and has his share in the World-to-Come depleted." This is because it is prohibited to derive benefit from the study of Torah in this world.

Beis Yosef (Y.D. 246, ד"ה ומ"ש דברי תורה) notes that Rambam's words are consistent with his view (Avos 4:5) which is that it is improper for scholars to collect stipends for learning. Yet it seems that even in the time of Rambam, it was a prevalent arrangement for Torah scholars to be financially rewarded for their diligence and commitment to Torah study.

However, Tashbetz (1:147) writes that the words of Rambam were only critical of the system of supporting Torah scholars in times when people were focused, and study of Torah for nine quality hours a day realistically could be combined with a few hours of labor to complete one's rounded schedule. Taking tzedakah under these conditions was unnecessary and even pathetic. However, in our days, forgetfulness is rampant, and a person involved in labor or business can rarely delve into deep and penetrating Torah study. Therefore, the halachah commends those who devote themselves to full-time Torah study, even if it means that they must be supported by others in order to do so.

The Gemara here recommends that a person be prepared to do even menial jobs and to avoid collecting tzedakah at all costs. This is to be understood as a recommendation, not as a hard and fast rule. Therefore today, it is not only permitted, but in many cases it is encouraged for a person to pursue full-time Torah study and to be part of a partnership to be supported by communal funds, if need be. ■

HALACHAH Highlight

Is it ever permitted to hate another Jew?

שונא ישראל, ומי שריא למסניו והכתיב לא תשנא את אחיך וכו' דחזיא ביה איהו דבר ערוה. ר"ג בר יצחק אמר מצוה לשנאותו

Is it indeed permitted to hate a Jew? Doesn't the Torah say, "Do not hate your brother (a fellow Jew)?" In a case where one saw someone doing something wrong, then it is permitted. R. Nachman bar Yitzchok says in such an instance it is actually a mitzvah to hate him.

It is clear from the Gemara that when one knows of the sins of someone else (regarding a sin which the perpetrator knows is prohibited¹) the transgressor is no longer called "your brother." Therefore it is no longer prohibited to hate him (for the restriction of hating only applies to someone who has the status of "your brother"). From our Gemara it is apparent that even if one sins due to yielding to his lusts, and not to spite God, it is still permitted, or even a mitzvah to hate him. [Perhaps this is what the Avos D'Rebbi Noson means² when it says, "If one acts like a Jew you should love him, but if he does not act like a Jew you should not love him."] However, in regards to the halachah of returning a lost object³ one who sins out of temptation is still considered "your brother" and you must return him his lost objects. There are differing opinions in the Rishonim⁴ on this topic. In practice⁵, there is a mitzvah to have mercy upon

and perform charitable acts for a Jew who sins out of temptation, provided he does not reject any of the 13 fundamental principles of Judaism. However, if he is given a warning⁶ and it goes unheeded, it is indeed a mitzvah to hate him. Others maintain⁷ that in our days there is no mitzvah to hate sinners. According to the Chazon Ish⁸, children who grew up in a non-religious environment have the halachic status of a שנסבה, and their actions are considered as if performed under duress. Therefore, one may not hate them. ■

1. עי' ח"ח בהלכות לשה"ר ד' ז'
2. באדר"נ פט"ז אות ה'. ועע"ש וצ"ע
3. בגמ' ע"ז כ"ו ב'
4. דלתוס' (בד"ה אני) ומאירי, בע"ז, בע"ז שם. מומר לתיאבון דינו כישראל וכפשטות הגמ' שם. וליראים סימן מ"ז (הובא בסמ"ג סמ"ק וטור יו"ד רנ"א) א"צ אפילו להחיותו. ולרמב"ם תלוי בהאם שונה באיולתו תמיד, וע"ע בשו"ת חת"ס חחו"מ בליקוטים סימן ס"ו, ובמקור מים חיים שבשו"ע יו"ד קנ"ח ס"א. וע"ע בשו"ע יו"ד רנ"א ס"א וב', ובסימן ב' ס"ה, ובחו"מ סימן ערב ס"א
5. כ"כ באהבת חסד ח"א פ"ג ס"ב, וכן במשנה ברורה שכ"ט ס"ק ט', וע"ע בח"ח בלשה"ר ד' ז'
6. בשו"ע חו"מ ער"ב ס"א, וכהגה"מ פ"ו מהלכות דעות
7. חזו"א ביו"ד סימן ב' אות כ"ח, עפ"י מש"כ בסוף האה"ח ממהר"י מולין ומהר"ם מלובלין שאצלינו תמיד בקודם תוהחה שאין אנו יודעים להוכיח. עכ"ד. ונראה שר"ל שכ"ה בערכין ט"ז ב' וכ"ה ברי"ף בבמ"צ י"ז א', שאין אנו יודעים להוכיח, אמנם אפ"ה סתימת השו"ע ונ"כ הנ"ל שכיון שהתרה בו ישנאהו, ודלא כחזו"א. וצ"א. ואפשר גם שמה"ט לשון השו"ע "התראה" ולא תוכחה, שאין לנו תוכחה, ואכ"ז כיון שהתרה, ישנאהו
8. זה עוד טעם בחזו"א הנ"ל. וע"ע בפוסקים ביו"ד קנ"ט ס"ד, והמ"ב שפ"ה ס"ק א' ושעה"צ ס"ק ב' נוטה להחמיר, וע"ע בסימן ש"ל ס"ב בב"ב בד"ה כותית. ובמקום אחר הרחבנו ואכמ"ל ■

STORIES Off the Daf

The greatness of living in Eretz Yisroel

שלשה מנוחלי העוה"ב אלו הן: הדר בא"י

The Ben Ish Chai, zt"l, explains that Eretz Yisroel is itself one of the three things that can only be acquired through suffering. He says, "One who has already acquired Eretz Yisroel through suffering has, naturally, already acquired a share in the World-to-Come!"

The Chofetz Chaim, zt"l, made superhuman efforts to make aliyah, and these efforts were an outward expression of his deep and abiding love for the Holy Land. He had fixed the date of his move for the summer of 5685 (1925),

and all of the preparations had been made. His papers were in order, and his students had established a home for him near the yeshiva in Petach Tikvah.

When it became widely known that he was about to leave Europe, Rav Chaim Ozer Grodzenski, zt"l, called an emergency conference of leading Rabbonim, and in one voice they begged the gadol hador not to abandon them.

The Chofetz Chaim tried to resist. "I am already old, I have no more strength. I cannot contribute anything more."

Rav Chaim Ozer argued with him. "A father doesn't abandon his children even when he is old; as long as he sits at the table, they behave completely differently."

The Chofetz Chaim agreed to defer

his journey until Elul. In the meantime, he sent a farewell letter to European Jewry, and made last minute arrangements. At the last moment, a delegation of great Roshei Yeshivah led by Rav Boruch Ber Leibowitz, zt"l, arrived in Radin and insisted that he wait until after the holidays. The gadol couldn't withstand the pressure, and agreed.

On the final day, the Rebbetzin fell ill and required surgery. After that, his daughter got sick. And in the meanwhile, the Chofetz Chaim himself weakened and the doctors forbade a long journey.

"It is clear that Heaven is blocking my way," he declared. He submitted to his destiny to live and die without seeing the Holy Land. ■

