

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) Clarifying the dispute between Tanna Kamma and R' Gamliel (cont.)

The contradiction between the two statements of R' Yochanan is resolved with the Gemara noting that there are three opinions on the matter. R' Gamliel maintains that the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** can discharge the tzibbur's obligation all year, R' Meir maintains that the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** discharges the public's obligation only on Rosh HaShanah, and Chachamim maintain that the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** never discharges the tzibbur's obligation.

The reason to distinguish between Rosh HaShanah/Yovel and the rest of the year is explained.

2) Reciting the pesukim in Musaf on Rosh HaShanah

R' Chananel in the name of Rav ruled that once a person states, "And in Your Torah it is so written," there is no obligation to recite the actual verses.

R' Yehoshua ben Levi states that this ruling applies even for the public's obligation **שליח ציבור**.

R' Elazar states that one should arrange his tefillah before davening.

R' Abba maintains that this is only true for tefillos that are not recited with regularity.

This assertion is unsuccessfully challenged.

3) Clarifying the dispute between Tanna Kamma and R' Gamliel (cont.)

Two versions of R' Shimon Chasida's statement are presented. According to the first version, R' Shimon Chasida asserted that the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** exempts even those who are in the field from their obligation to daven.

After the first version is successfully challenged the second version is presented in which R' Shimon Chasida asserts that according to R' Gamliel it is only those people who are in the field that the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** exempts from their obligation to daven. ■

הזרן עלך יום טוב

וסליקא לה מסכת ראש השנה



Today's Daf Digest is dedicated wishing Mazal Tov
on the recent wedding of our children
Linda and Asaf Sinvani

Distinctive INSIGHT

Can the individual recite the Amidah for the individual?

הלכה כרבנן גמiliyal בברכות של ראש השנה ושל יום הכיפורים

Many of the Poskim rule according to Rabban Gamliel, that the one leading the services can recite the Amidah and others can listen and fulfill their obligation. Nevertheless, Tur writes that it is better for each individual to recite the Amidah on his own. The reason is that in order to utilize this ruling of Rabban Gamliel, a person would have to be attentive to every word being said by the public's obligation **שליח ציבור**, without missing even one word. This is too demanding of a standard to expect from the average listener.

Magen Avraham adds three additional concerns which make this ruling impractical. According to Rashi and to Tosafos, the ruling of Rabban Gamliel was only said for the benefit of the people "of the fields," who cannot come and daven for themselves. However, those who can come to shul are expected to do so and must daven for themselves. Others say that the ruling of Rabban Gamliel who allows the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** to be **מושcia** individuals was only said in reference to the additional blessings of **מלכיות**, etc. However, the standard seven blessings of the Yom Tov Amidah must be said by each person for himself. A third problem is that now we interrupt the repetition of the Amidah with many additional songs and prayers, so that a listener cannot fulfill his obligation of saying the Amidah by listening to the public's obligation **שליח ציבור**.

Tur cites the opinion of the **עיטור** who explains that the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** does not exempt anyone who is able to daven on his own (**בקי**). Beis Yosef questions this opinion, as it seems to be in direct conflict with the Gemara, where we find that we rule according to Rabban Gamliel, and just as the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** can recite the Amidah for the illiterate, he is effective for everyone else, as well.

Sefer **יום תרואה** suggests that perhaps the **עיטור** understands that there are three categories of people. There are those who are illiterate (**עם שבשות**), there are those who are somewhat competent, and there are those who are literate (**בקי**). When the Gemara states that the public's obligation **שליח ציבור** can exempt the "competent ones" it only refers to the second category, but not to those who are fully literate. ■

HALACHAH Highlight

Is the shlichat tzibbur an agent of the community?

לא פטר ר' גמליאל אלא עם שבשדות מאי טעמא משום דאניסי במלאכה

R' Gamliel exempted only the people in the fields [from davening]. What is the reason? Because they are forced by their work to miss davening

Shulchan Aruch¹ writes that a person may not serve as **שליח ציבור** unless he has the agreement of the members of the community, and even one person has the authority to prevent another from serving as **שליח ציבור**. Rav Avrohom Avli Gombiner², the Magen Avrohom, asserts that this ruling applied only when the **שליח ציבור** discharged the obligation of the tzibbur. Nowadays, however, when people daven themselves, an individual cannot prevent one from serving as **שליח ציבור**. It seems that the Magen Avrohom understood that the **שליח ציבור** acts as an agent of the tzibbur, and therefore even an individual can protest another acting as his agent. This approach is supported by the Mishnah which writes that if the **שליח ציבור** makes a mistake it reflects badly on the tzibbur because, “a person’s agent is like himself.”

Teshuvas Beis Shearim³, on the other hand, writes that the **שליח ציבור** is not considered the agent of the tzibbur. The basis for this is the explanation of Tosafos Rid⁴ who writes that one may not appoint an agent to perform a mitzvah that requires the body to fulfill the mitzvah. For example, one may not appoint an agent to don tefillin for him

REVIEW and Remember

- According to R' Meir, when does a **שליח ציבור** discharge the tzibbur's obligation?
- According to R' Meir, why are the berachos of Musaf on Rosh HaShanah different from berachos of any other tefillah?
- Is there a requirement to recite the pesukim related to **זכונות, מלכיות, שופרות**?
- How do people in the fields fulfill their obligation to daven?

since the tefillin must be worn by the person himself. Similarly, asserts Beis Shearim, one may not appoint an agent to daven for him since davening is a mitzvah that requires the person to perform the mitzvah himself. Beis Shearim writes that all sources that indicate that the **שליח ציבור** acts as an agent of the tzibbur understand that it works in accordance with the concept that permits kohanim to offer korbonos. Just like the Torah invests in them the power to act on behalf of the nation, even though they are, technically, not our agents, so too a **שליח ציבור** works within the same framework—namely, he can pray on our behalf without technically being our agent. ■

1. שו"ע או"ח סי' נ"ג סע' י"ט

2. מג"א שם סק"ב

3. ש"ת בית שערים או"ח סי' רע"א

4. ■ תוס' הר"ד קידושין מב: ד"ה שאין

STORIES Off the Daf

The Chazaras HaShatz

לא פטר רבנן גמליאל אלא עם שבשדות

According to the Gemara, one who is not fully familiar with the words of the Amidah can listen intently to the **shlichat tzibbur** and discharge his obligation. This can even be true of one who cannot come to synagogue to pray at all.

Someone once asked the Kotzker Rebbe, zt”l, “Why do we still repeat the Amidah nowadays? After all, everyone says the Amidah for themselves. What

need is there for a **shlichat tzibbur**?”

The Kotzker Rebbe responded, “As you know, if one wishes to bring merit to the soul of a person who has died, electing to lead the prayers is one way to do it. One of the reasons for this is, of course, the kaddish. But one can say kaddish even without being the chazzan! The truth is that the **חזרת הש"ץ** also helps the souls of those who have passed away. And this is why it is an injunction that will never be revoked, even though it has been many long centuries that people have already known how to pray for themselves. One would be hard pressed to find someone who really doesn’t say the entire service for himself.

When someone put these questions to the Chazon Ish, zt”l, he answered differently. “We still recite the **חזרת הש"ץ** for the **עם שבשדות**, the people stuck in the fields, of today. They are those people who do not pray because they don’t know better. Either they or their parents were influenced by the modern sectarian and ‘enlightenment’ movements, and they don’t understand the importance of prayer at all. Since these people are considered like people taken captive while young and raised among non-Jews, they are hardly responsible for their failure to come to synagogue. We recite the **חזרת הש"ץ** for them!” ■