



OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) MISHNAH: (cont.)

2) Identifying the author of our Mishnah

From the first halacha of the Mishnah regarding the violation of kneading for pouring water onto the dry ingredients that will become ink, it is evident that physically mixing the ingredients into a single mass is unnecessary to violate the prohibition.

R' Yosef asserts that the Mishnah follows the opinion of Rebbi, and not the opinion of R' Yosi berebi Yehudah who argues this point.

Abaye differs and maintains that regarding the Mishnah's case perhaps even R' Yosi berebi Yehudah would agree.

3) Beginning a melacha before Shabbos that will continue on its own on Shabbos

A Baraisa lists a number of activities which can be started before Shabbos even though the melacha will continue on Shabbos. The one case the Baraisa prohibits is placing wheat into a water mill if the wheat will continue to be ground on Shabbos.

Rabbah explains that the case of the mill is prohibited because of the noise it makes. R' Yosef disagrees and suggests the reason is because of the obligation to keep even one's utensils at rest on Shabbos. The Gemara proceeds to explain why the other cases of the Baraisa, which is assumed to reflect the opinion of Beis Hillel, do not violate the principle of "shevisas keilim."

The Gemara proceeds to demonstrate that Beis Shamai is the one who subscribes to the principle of shevisas keilim and Beis Hillel is the one who does not subscribe to this principle.

4) Putting something on a fire to begin cooking before Shabbos

A Baraisa is quoted that prohibits putting certain foods on the fire to cook before Shabbos if the cooking will continue into Shabbos. It would seem that the Baraisa is only consistent with the opinion of Beis Shamai. The Gemara responds that regarding cooking even Beis Hillel would agree that the process may not be started before Shabbos if it will continue on Shabbos because of the fear that one may come to stir the coals.

Different cases of cooking are discussed and the basic principle is that when there is no concern that one will stir the coals it is permitted but when there is such a fear it is prohibited.

5) Giving an object to a non-Jew before Shabbos

A Baraisa is quoted in which Beis Shamai repeats his strict ruling prohibiting giving an object to a non-Jew before Shabbos, and there is a dispute whether Beis Hillel agrees that there is limited concern that the non-Jew will carry or, like R' Akiva, there is no concern whatsoever.

6) Giving chometz to a non-Jew before Pesach

Beis Shamai prohibits giving chometz to a non-Jew if it will not be consumed before Pesach because of the obligation to destroy chometz and Beis Hillel disputes this ruling. R' Yehudah, following the opinion of Beis Shamai, prohibits even giving foods to a non-Jew thirty days before Pesach if the food has a long shelf life. ■

Today's Daf Digest is dedicated
l'illui nishmas Perla bas Naftali Nachman
by Alan and Sheila Shapiro

Distinctive INSIGHT

Put the nix on mixing?

וניחוש שמא מגיס בה

Rashi explains that by turning the food over and stirring it, even food that is cooked is cooked further. The Gemara answers that this is permitted if the pot was removed from the fire.

This dialogue in the Gemara has profound practical application for us. Rashba points out that removing food invariably causes the food remaining in the pot to shift around. Food on top settles further down, closer to the hot temperatures lower in the pot. Taking food out with a spoon or ladle should be prohibited, even if the pot has been removed from the fire, because it entails mixing of the remaining food.

Rashba (and Rosh, Ran) answers that once the food is half cooked (or one-third cooked according to Rashi), there is no longer a problem of mixing the food. It is already minimally edible, and cooking it further is not a problem in this manner.

Rambam, however, does not allow stirring a pot of food, and also removing any food from it, unless it is fully cooked, and this is the ruling of the Shulchan Aruch (318:4, 18). Therefore, if the food is not fully cooked, and someone stirs the pot heavily as he removes food from it, this would be a Torah prohibition. If he removes food gently with a ladle, this would be a violation of a rabbinic injunction. This is true even if the food is removed from the fire.

Once the food is fully cooked, the Mechaber allows removing food with a spoon, but the Rema rules that we never take food from a pot while it is still on the fire. In fact, Rema even disallows removing food from a pot which is removed from the fire, because it is considered stirring. The suggested method is to pour the food from the pot rather than remove it with a spoon. Mishnah Berura (#117) immediately points out that our

Continued on page 2)

REVIEW and Remember

1. Why does Beis Shamai agree that one may place a beam on grapes or olives before Shabbos?

2. Is one permitted to benefit from melacha done by a Jew on Shabbos?

3. Why is it permitted to put raw food on the fire immediately before Shabbos?

4. According to R' Akiva, under what circumstance would it be prohibited to give an object, before Shabbos, to a non-Jew?

HALACHAH Highlight

Issues about Shabbos Clocks (timers)

תנו רבנן: פותקין מים לגינה ערב שבת עם חשיכה, ומתמלאות והולכת כל היום כולו.

One may open a conduit for water from a spring to a garden on Friday just prior to sunset, and allow it to continue to flow and fill the garden with water throughout the Shabbos.

Even though watering plants on Shabbos is prohibited due to the act of planting, here, since the work began before Shabbos and continues on its own after Shabbos begins, it is permitted.

Rav Moshe Feinstein¹ discusses the use of timers on Shabbos, such as to place food in an oven and position a timer to turn the oven on sometime during Shabbos and prepare the food. He rules that this cannot be permitted. He explains that only when the entire action of the category of labor (מלאכה) was completed on Friday, such as placing a pot on the fire, or the opening of a channel of water from a spring to a garden, as discussed in our passage, where likewise the entire act was completed on Friday, and the very activity itself of the water flowing began on Friday. In these cases, the human activity involved begins and ceases on Friday, and the activity itself begins on Friday. However, in our case where the forbidden activity itself has not begun at all on Friday, one cannot say that the human connection has ceased, since the activity itself has not begun. Under these conditions a permissive ruling cannot be found. Still, it should be said that a clear prohibitive indication is not found either. Rav Feinstein explains that possibly this activity is included in the Rabbinic interdiction against asking a gentile to do a prohibited labor on Shabbos, since in both cases an activity is being initiated at the Jew's request on Shabbos. Rav Feinstein continues to say that even if we say that the Rabbis only prohibited a direct request from a gentile, still, being that this is an

(Insight...continued from page 1)

custom is not like the Rema in this detail, and we do allow removal of fully cooked food if it has been removed from the fire.

In conclusion, if someone wants to take chulent on Friday night, it must be fully cooked, and it must be removed from the fire. The desired food can be taken, but no stirring of the pot can be done other than that. ■

act demeaning of the sanctity of the Shabbos it should be forbidden. For this creates a terribly demeaning atmosphere for the Shabbos, in view of the fact that by this method all sorts of prohibited Shabbos activity could be done. There is nothing more undignified for the Shabbos than this. Thus, this use of timers is included in the general prohibition against debasing the sanctity of the Shabbos.

Rav Feinstein adds that it has already become common practice to utilize the timers to turn on and turn off lights. This does not need to be barred. The reason being that a similar practice was previously widespread to have gentiles turn off lamps, and even under certain conditions to light them as well, thus this is not considered demeaning to the spirit of Shabbos being that it is an accepted practice in many places. Additionally, it enhances the Shabbos meal when the meal is shared in a lit room.

Elsewhere², Rav Feinstein writes that even if one was invited to eat at the home of someone who is lenient with this, one should not partake in food prepared in this fashion. Only with regard to turning on lights did Rav Feinstein rule that there is place for leniency³. ■

1. שו"ת אגרות משה (ח"ד מחאוי"ח סי' ס') באריכות. ובקיצור שם (סי' מ אות ב). ע"ש. אבל השווה לשו"ת משנה הלכות מהד"ק (ח"ד סי' לד). ואכמ"ל.
2. שו"ת אגרות משה (ח"ה מחאוי"ח סי' כד אות ה')
3. ע"י גם בשו"ת שבט הלוי ח"א (סי' מז) בזה. ■

STORIES off the Daf

Fresh Brewed Coffee

לא ימלא נחתום חבית של מים כו' גזירה שמא יחתה בגחלים

A story is told by R' Moshe Aryeh Leib Rosenbaum, the author of מתא דירושלים Yerushalmi, which he heard directly from the Chasam Sofer. The Torah scholars of a certain city wanted to be able to stay up late on Friday night to study Torah, and they also wanted to have hot coffee to drink. They devised a system which they set up before Shabbos which they wanted to implement. They took a pot of cold, uncooked coffee and placed it on a pile of small sticks. They took a material which smol-

dered slowly, and they placed it under the sticks. They ignited the material which served as a type of wick, and it smoldered for several hours. After midnight, the small sticks caught, and a small fire burned under the coffee pot, cooking it and allowing the men to have their coffee. Even though if this would be done on Shabbos, it would constitute the labor of cooking, these men figured that it was allowed, because we hold according to Beis Hillel who holds that melacha set into motion before Shabbos is permitted.

The מתא דירושלים writes that this contraption does not fully solve the problem. Our Gemara concludes that even Beis Hillel holds that there is also a concern that one might stir the pot on Friday night, and leaving something on an open flame is prohibit-

ed according to everyone.

Nevertheless, a solution to this problem was proposed by Rabbi Yissachar Shlomo Teichmel in his response משנה שכיר. The Rema rules (257:1) that if a person intends any particular food for Shabbos morning, and not for the night meal, once he places that pot on the fire as Shabbos is to begin, we assume he will forget about stirring the flame, and by the next morning it would finish cooking even without stirring the coals.

However, according to his conclusion, R' Teichmel (in his response, #68) prohibits this type of setup to cook coffee. In fact, this is not the only contraption the scholars of that city tried to arrange. They even built a type of fuse made from twisted fabric and alcohol, but even that was deemed prohibit-

