



## OVERVIEW of the Daf

### 1) Roasting an egg (cont.)

The Gemara demonstrates from a Mishnah that even a slight degree of cooking that makes a food edible is a violation of the Torah prohibition against cooking.

### 2) Cooking methods

To resolve an apparent contradiction between our Mishnah and another, R' Nachman explains that cooking in the sun is permitted according to all opinions, and cooking with a derivative of fire is prohibited according to all opinions. The dispute between R' Yosi and the Chachamim is whether it is prohibited to cook with a derivative of the sun, the Chachamim prohibit such a practice whereas R' Yosi permits the practice.

### 3) Clarifying the opinion of R' Yosi

The Gemara wonders why R' Yosi does not permit roasting an egg by burying it in the sand heated by the sun since he takes a lenient position regarding cooking in sun derivatives.

Rabbah explains that it is prohibited, because it could lead a person to roast an egg in ash which would be a Torah prohibition. R' Yosef explains that it is prohibited because burying the egg in the sand involves moving the dirt from its place which violates the prohibition against plowing.

R' Yosef's position is unsuccessfully challenged.

### 4) Running cold water through the hot springs of Tiberias

R' Chisda deduces from the prohibitive ruling of the Chachamim that it is prohibited to insulate a food with material that increases its heat even before Shabbos.

Ulla rules leniently like the residents of Tiberias but R' Nachman differs, claiming that the residents of Tiberias ultimately agreed with the strict ruling of the Chachamim.

### 5) Bathing or rinsing one's entire body with hot water on Shabbos

The Gemara questions what type of bathing is prohibited with the water heated by the hot springs of Tiberias.

R' Ika bar Chananyah answers that the Mishnah is referring to rinsing one's entire body, following the opinion of R' Shimon who would permit rinsing one's entire body with cold water or hot water that was heated before Shabbos.

R' Chisda explains that the disagreement regarding rinsing one's entire body refers to water that is in the ground but to rinse one's body with water that is in a utensil is prohibited according to all opinions.

R' Yochanan is quoted as ruling like the middle position of R' Yehudah who prohibits any bathing or rinsing of one's entire body on Shabbos even if the water was heated before Shabbos.

R' Yosef questions Rabbah bar Chanah whether he heard this ruling explicitly or perhaps it was deduced from a general statement made by R' Yochanan. ■

## Gemara GEM

### *In the Heat of the Sun*

כי פליגי בתולדת חמה, מר סבר גזרינן תולדות חמה אטו תולדות האור וכו'

The halacha is according to the Chachamim that we may not cook on a surface that has been heated by the sun. The reason is that it is impossible to tell the difference between a hot surface heated by the sun or if it was heated by fire. Our sages had to disallow cooking on any heated surface, even if it was heated by the sun, in order that no one come to use a surface which was heated by fire.

Rashi explains that the reason why cooking directly in the sun is allowed is because this is not the normal way of cooking. Accordingly, there is an argument, that if heating something in the sun is done in a normal fashion, for example using a solar-powered water heater, then such a device might be prohibited. Nevertheless, the definition of "normal" is not a function of any particular device, but it is rather the concept of cooking itself that is being defined. For example, the Gemara clearly rules that if the hot-springs of Teveria are "fire-heated", then using them is prohibited on Shabbos. If they are considered "sun-heated", then cooking in them is permitted. This is true even though any cooking in them is not unusual. We clearly see that the definition of cooking is based upon the source of the heat being the "fire" or the "sun", and not upon if the activity in and of itself is commonly done. ■

## REVIEW and Remember

1. Why is it not permitted to rinse old fish in hot water on Shabbos?  
\_\_\_\_\_
2. What is the point of dispute between R' Yosi and the Chachamim regarding alternative forms of cooking?  
\_\_\_\_\_
3. What is the point of dispute between R' Yosi and the Chachamim regarding alternative forms of cooking?  
\_\_\_\_\_
4. Why did R' Akiva not qualify to be a "mediator" between R' Eliezer and R' Yehoshua?  
\_\_\_\_\_

# HALACHAH Highlight

## Showering in cold water on Shabbos

דתניא לא ישתטף אדם כל גופו, בין בחמין ובין בצונן דברי רבי מאיר. רבי שמעון מתייר. רבי יהודה אומר בחמין אסור, בצונן מותר. אמר רב חסדא מחלוקת בכלי, אבל בקרקע דברי הכל מותר. והא מעשה דאנשי טבריא בקרקע הוה ואסרי להו רבנן? אלא אי איתמר הכי איתמר: מחלוקת בקרקע, אבל בכלי דברי הכל אסור. אמר רבה בר בר חנה אמר רבי יוחנן הלכה כרבי יהודה.

*For we have learned in a Baraisa: one may not rinse his entire body, whether with hot or cold water, so says R' Meir. R' Shimon permits rinsing with both hot and cold water. R' Yehuda says that rinsing with hot water is forbidden, while rinsing with cold water is permitted. Rav Chisda said that the disagreement between R' Yehuda and R' Shimon is only in regards to water in a vessel, while water in the ground, all would agree that it would be permitted. ... Rather if anything was said by Rav Chisda this is what was said: the disagreement is only in regard to water in the ground, however water in a vessel everyone would agree is prohibited. Rabbah bar Rav Chana said in the name of R' Yochanan that the law accords with the view of R' Yehudah.*

R' Yochanan's statement that the Halacha is in accordance with the view of R' Yehudah is echoed by the three pillars of Halacha: the Rif<sup>1</sup>, Rambam<sup>2</sup> and Rosh<sup>3</sup>. The Shulchan Aruch<sup>4</sup> rules accordingly.

In deliberating the parameters of this law, the Beis Yosef<sup>5</sup> cites two conflicting opinions: the opinion of the Sefer HaTerumah<sup>6</sup> and the Mordechai<sup>7</sup>. The Sefer HaTerumah, as understood by the Beis Yosef, opines that one is permitted to immerse his entire body in cold water on Shabbos (רחיצה). The Mordechai, however, holds that R' Yehuda only permits rinsing (שטיפה), meaning having water poured upon the person; however, immersing is forbidden even in cold water. The Mordechai explains that this restriction is only upon water that is contained, such that it is akin to being in a vessel, but to immerse in a river would surely be permitted. The Shulchan Aruch<sup>8</sup> sides with the Sefer HaTerumah, and permits full immersion in cold water, as well as rinsing. It would appear that this is the opinion of the Rema<sup>9</sup> as well.

However, some Rishonim<sup>10</sup> note a custom to act strictly and not immerse in rivers, although the Halacha would appear to permit it. The Maharil<sup>11</sup> advances three possible motives for this custom: a) the concern for possible transgressions of the prohibition of squeezing fluids (סחיטה), b) the risk of people transporting the water clinging to them, c) the potentiality that people will swim<sup>12</sup> and/or push away

leaves and the like<sup>13</sup>. The Magen Avraham<sup>14</sup> quotes these sources and others and rules in accordance with the custom. The Mishnah Berura<sup>15</sup> follows the Magen Avraham and notes that the custom is to prohibit immersing on Shabbos. However, the Sephardim<sup>16</sup> and the Yemenites<sup>17</sup> do not have this custom; nevertheless, they must be careful for the above listed concerns.

The Poskim discuss a modern application of this Halacha: is showering in cold water permitted on Shabbos? Some Poskim<sup>18</sup> based upon the above cited custom and other concerns rule that showering on Shabbos in cold water is prohibited. Rav Moshe Feinstein<sup>19</sup> points out that this custom exists only in regard to **immersing** in a river or the like, however, showering is akin to **rinsing**, and no prohibiting custom is found for such. Yet, notes Rav Feinstein, people on their own do not shower in cold water on Shabbos. After deliberation of the status of this quasi-custom of not showering in cold water on Shabbos, Rav Feinstein rules that one may not shower in cold water on Shabbos unless the heat causes him considerable discomfort. This conclusion is held by other authorities<sup>20</sup> as well. Still, one must be very careful not to squeeze his hair or the towel. ■

1. רי"ף כאן (דף יח ע"ב בדפי הרי"ף)
2. רמב"ם (פכ"ב מהלי שבת ה"ב)
3. רא"ש (פרק כ"ה סימן ו')
4. שו"ע (סי' שכו ס"א)
5. ב"י (רי"ש סי' שכו)
6. ס' התרומה (סי' רלג)
7. מרדכי כאן (רמז שג) בשם ר"י. ע"י תוס' (כאן ד"ה והא).
8. שו"ע שם. וע"י בעולת שבת (שם ס"ק טז) שדייק כן גם מדברי מרן שם ס"ח. ע"ש.
9. ע"י בד"מ הארוך שהביא כל דברי הבי"ר. וגם עבר בשתיקה כהודאה על דברי מרן בשו"ע ולא כלום. ודו"ק.
10. שו"ת תרומת הדשן (סי' רנה) ושו"ת מהרי"ל (סי' קלט) וכן בשו"ת מהרי"ל החדשות (סי' צו) ביתר שאת.
11. שו"ת מהרי"ל (סי' קלט). והשווה לאשר כתב בשו"ת מהרי"ל החדשות (סי' צו).
12. איסורו במי שלט ס"ב
13. איסורו שם ס"ו
14. מג"א (סי' שכו ס"ק ח). אמנם יש לציין לדברי העולת שבת (שם ס"ק טז) שעלה לציין את דברי המהרי"ל ואח"כ כתב: "ועכשיו נתפשט המנהג להתיר בכל ענין." ע"ש. והוב"ד בכפח"ח שם (אות כה).
15. משני"ב שם (ס"ק ט וס"ק כא) וע"י אזהרותיו של הערה"ש (סי' שכו ס"ט) שלא לפרוץ גדר מנהג זה. וכן הזכיר המנהג בשו"ת אגרות משה (ח"ב מחאה"ע סי' יג וח"ג מחאה"ח סי' פז)
16. ע"י ס' לוי"ת חן (אות פ, עמ' כבג). וע"י בכף החיים (סי' שכו אותיות כה ולא).
17. ע"י שו"ע המקוצר (שבת – סי' סט אות ג)
18. רבי דוד אסטרייכר בשו"ת תפארת אדם ח"א (סי' כח, עמ' עו), והחזו"א הובא בס' דינים והנהגות ממרן החזו"א (או"ח פ"י"ג אות כט, עמ' עו) ובפסקי תשובות (סי' שכו הערה 14) כתב שכן הוא בשונה הלכות בשם החזו"א. ואמ"א. וכן ראה בשו"ת מנחת יצחק ח"ו (ס"ס לב)
19. שו"ת אגרות משה (ח"ד מחאה"ח סי' עה אות א). והד"ן בקיצור שם (סי' עד רחיצה אות ג)
20. ע"י הגהת רעק"א (סי' שכו ס"א) וקצות השלחן (סי' קלג בבדי השלחן סוף אות ח') ובשו"ת באר משה ח"ו (סי' עג) ובס' שערים המצוינים בהלכה (סי' פו אות א) ובס' ילקוט יוסף (כרך ד' מהל' שבת סי' שכו אות ג). וע"י ס' תשובות והנהגות ח"א (סי' רכב). וכן ראה בשו"ת מנחת יצחק ח"ו (ס"ס לב).

# STORIES Off the Daf

## Mikvah Water Heated on Shabbos

חמין שהוחמו בשבת הוא דאסורין

Rav Moshe Feinstein ז"ל was the Rav of Luban, Russia, before he came to America. The Russians sought to close down the mikvah of the town, and turn it into a swimming pool. However, unbeknownst to the Russian authorities, Rav Moshe had bribed the builder who transformed the mikvah into a swimming pool to arrange that some of the details of the construction allow for it to remain a

kosher mikvah. The builder complied with Rav Moshe's specifications. Rav Moshe therefore ruled that the swimming pool was still able to be used as a kosher mikvah.

Though Rav Moshe told the townspeople that they could use the mikvah, it was actually only kosher b'Dieved. Rav Moshe and his wife did not rely on the mikvah as being kosher. However, Rav Moshe knew that if his wife would never go to the swimming pool mikvah, the community would eventually realize that the Rov did not rely on the mikvah as being kosher. The townspeople would also stop going to the mikvah, causing them to transgress issurei kareis. Rav

Moshe therefore told his wife to continue going to the mikvah, even though she did not rely on its being kosher.

There was another issue raised regarding the use of the mikvah, which had to do with the Jewish caretaker of the swimming pool. This Jew would heat the water for the pool on Shabbos. Our Gemara clearly says that one is not allowed to use water which was heated on Shabbos. After discussing this issue at length (see Igros Moshe Orach Chayim 1:126), Rav Moshe ruled that due to the extreme circumstances, a woman could use the mikvah even when the water was heated, if she could not immerse on a different day. ■

