



OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) Krias Shema (cont.)

The Gemara makes an inference concerning Rebbi's position about reading the Torah in other languages.

This inference is rejected.

An inference is made concerning Rabanan's position about reading the Torah in other languages.

This inference is rejected.

2) Tefilla

The reason tefilla could be said in any language is explained.

The Mishnah's statement that tefilla could be recited in any language is unsuccessfully challenged.

The assertion that angels do not understand Aramaic is challenged.

Two resolutions to the challenge are recorded.

3) Clarifying the Mishnah

The sources that Birkas Hamazon, oaths of testimony and oaths of deposit can be said in any language are identified.

The sources that the declaration over the bikkurim and the blessings and curses of Mt. Gerizim and Mt. Eival must be in Hebrew are identified.

4) Chalitzah

The exchange between Rabanan and R' Yehudah regarding the source that spoken part of the chalitzah ritual must

(Continued on page 2)

Distinctive INSIGHT

"The entire Torah is said in any language"

לימא קסבר רבי כל התורה כולה בכל לשון נאמרה

Rebbe understands that שמע must be recited in its original לשון הקדש based upon the word "והיו" in the verse. It seems, says the Gemara, that in cases where this directive from the Torah is not present, we would allow readings to be read in any language. Rashi explains that the "readings" to which the Gemara refers are the public reading of the Torah in the synagogues.

Tosafos in Megilla (17b) notes that according to Rashi, the reading of the Torah in shul is Torah mandated, as we see that a verse (והיו) is interpreted referring to the details how it is to be read. This seems to be difficult, though, as we know that the reading of the Torah in shul was enacted by the prophets (see Bava Kamma 82a). Tosafos acknowledges that there is a Torah requirement to read the episode of Amalek, but, other than that, how can we say that the Torah determines the details regarding the reading of the Torah in shul, when this halacha is not extant in Torah law? Tosafos therefore explains that the Gemara here is referring to the mitzvos which require some reading, such as chalitzah, eglarufa, and the declarations of ma'aser and bikkurim. Rebbe holds that these may be said in any language, but Shema must be read in לשון הקדש.

In our Gemara, Tosafos cites חננאל רבינו who explains that Rebbe here is referring to the writing of a Sefer Torah, which may be done in any language (כל התורה בכל לשון נאמרה). If it may be written in any language, this would mean that the various mitzvah-readings may be read in these other languages as well. If a Sefer Torah must be written in לשון הקדש, this indicates that formal readings must also be done in לשון הקדש only, for otherwise a reader using a foreign language would be saying words that are not written, which would then constitute reading by heart. The Gemara is therefore noting that a Sefer Torah may be written in any language, and readings such as chalitzah and eglarufa may be done in the language in which the sefer is written. This, the Gemara feels, is apparent from the fact that Shema alone is required to be read in its original לשון הקדש, and this is only based upon an analysis of the word "והיו" in this context.

In defense of Rashi, who seems to say that reading of the Torah in synagogue is mandated by Torah law, some want to suggest that Rashi himself agrees that the only sections which must be read מדאורייתא are the portions of Parah and Zachor. Nevertheless, now that we have the enactment of Ezra, and we read the Torah regularly, Rashi properly refers to the common, routine reading of the Torah in general (Pnei Yehoshua). ■

REVIEW and Remember

1. What is the source that prayer could be recited in any language?

2. What is the source that birkas hamazon may be recited in any language?

3. Are the mountains of Gerizim and Eival located near the Jordan river?

4. Where did the Aron HaKodesh normally travel?

Today's Daf Digest is dedicated
by Mr. and Mrs. Shmuel Yaakov Meystel
In loving memory of their mother
מרת סימא בת ר' פסח, ע"ה
Mrs. Selma Behren

HALACHAH Highlight

Davening in Aramaic without a tzibur

דאמר ר' יוחנן כל השואל צרכיו בלשון ארמי אין מלאכי השרת נזקקין לו

As R' Yochanan taught: Whoever requests his needs in Aramaic, the Ministering Angels do not pay attention to him

Rabbeinu Yehudah ben Yakar¹ in his commentary to the siddur wrote that one should not recite **יקום פרקן** unless one is together with a tzibur. The reason is that the Ministering Angels do not understand Aramaic and will not know to take these tefilos to Hashem. Similarly, commentators² state that one should not recite the paragraphs of selichos that were composed in Aramaic when davening alone since the Ministering Angels will not know to address them.

Rav Yosef Chaim of Baghdad³ also addressed the issue of reciting prayers in Aramaic. After citing our Gemara, he explained that the reason some of the paragraphs of selichos were composed in Aramaic was that selichos are recited by the tzibur and our Sages wanted to demonstrate that the power of the tzibur is great and does not require the assistance of the Angels for their tefilos to rise before Hashem. Most of the selichos, however, are in L'shon Kodesh since that is the preferred language of tefilah. Accordingly, the reason an individual should not daven in Aramaic is that as an individual he requires the assistance of the Angels and by davening in Aramaic he presents himself as a tzadik who does not need the assistance of the Angels. This causes the Heavens to scrutinize his deeds to determine whether he is, in fact, a tzadik of this stature and this scrutiny is dangerous. He adds, however, that

be performed in Hebrew is recorded.

A Baraisa is cited that supports the Gemara's understanding of R' Yehudah.

5) Blessings and curses

A Baraisa presents the position of R' Yehudah who puts Mt. Gerizim and Mt. Eival in a different location than the Tanna of the Mishnah.

The Baraisa also records the opinion of R' Elazar who disagrees with R' Yehudah and interprets the relevant verses differently.

6) Crossing the Jordan River

A Baraisa is cited that elaborates on the event of the Jewish People crossing the Jordan River. ■

(Overview. Continued from page 1)

when an individual recites selichos it is not necessary to skip the paragraph **רחמנא** since selichos are generally recited in L'shon Kodesh and the paragraphs the precede and follow that paragraph are in L'shon Kodesh so there is no concern that reciting this one paragraph in Aramaic will cause the Heavens to scrutinize his record. He adds, however, that the paragraphs **מחי ומסי** and **מרנא דבשמיא** should be omitted when a person is reciting selichos without a minyan. In contrast, Mishnah Berurah⁴ rules that all the paragraphs that are in Aramaic should be omitted when one is not davening together with a minyan. ■

1. פיורש ר' יהודה בן יקר עמ' כ'
2. מהר"א הלוי אבי השל"ה הספרו עמק ברכה דינים לימי הסליחות סי' נ"ט
3. שו"ת תורה לשמה סי' מ"ט
4. מ"ב סי' תקפ"א סק"ד ■

STORIES Off the Daf

Hebrew or English?

ותפילה בכל לשון

The baal teshuvah movement in America has brought to light many issues that were hardly addressed by earlier verses. One such issue is regarding prayer. Is it better for ba'alei teshuvah to daven the daily services in English or in Hebrew? They are surely more comfortable in English since they can keep up and they understand the whole prayer.

One rabbi was asked just such a question by a relatively new ba'al teshu-

vah. "Rabbi, I am not sure what I should do. On the one hand, I struggle to daven but still can only recite from **יוצר אור** until **שמונה עשרה** with any fluency. And even so, I am not sure what it all means. Should I just daven in English, or should I continue to say what I have been saying?"

The rabbi replied, "Even though most poskim hold that one may not start at **יוצר אור**, it is better for you to rely on the Chayei Adam who permits this than to say all of the prayers in English."

"Although the Gemara says in Sotah 33 that one discharges his obligation if he prays in any language, the Chasam Sofer, ז"ל, writes that one should not

make a regular habit of this practice. The Nefesh Hachaim, ז"ל, writes that one who prays in Hebrew accesses the highest realms even if he doesn't know what he is saying. The prayers in Hebrew are very powerful and were composed through ruach hakodesh. Saying them in English simply does not have the same effect. Also, I don't believe you will remain ignorant of the meaning of the prayers. In time, I am sure you will learn and know the meaning of the prayers."

The rabbi concluded, "Nevertheless, you should make strong efforts to at least say **אשרי**, **ברוך שאמר** and **ישתבח** so that you satisfy the opinions of the Mishnah Berurah and other great poskim! ■

