

## OVERVIEW of the Daf

### 1) Correct reading (cont.)

Rava rules that the words יהא שמיה רבא מברך must be read together.

R' Safra disputes both of Rava's rulings.

### 2) Reading Hallel

A Baraisa taught that Rabbi repeated some pesukim in Hallel and R' Elazar ben Parta repeated even more pesukim.

Abaye explains which pesukim were repeated by R' Elazar ben Parta.

Abaye explains that the Mishnah's ruling concerning the brachah of Hallel applies only for the brachah that follows Hallel, but everyone agrees that one should make a brachah before reading Hallel.

The Gemara explains how we know that the word עובר means "before."

3) **MISHNAH:** The Mishnah describes the correct method of "purchasing" a shemittah esrog.

### 4) Clarifying the Mishnah

R' Huna states that if the seller does not wish to give the esrog as a gift, its value should be included in the purchase price of the lulav.

The reason one may not give the value of the esrog directly to the seller is the prohibition against giving shemittah money to an עַם הָאָרֶץ.

R' Sheishes notes an apparent contradiction between a Baraisa and a Mishnah concerning how much shemittah food one person can purchase at one time.

The contradiction is resolved.

The Gemara questions why it is permitted to purchase a lulav from an עַם הָאָרֶץ if there is a prohibition against giving shemittah money to an עַם הָאָרֶץ.

The Gemara explains that during the shemittah year since the lulav grew during the sixth year it does not contain sanctity, but the esrog is considered a shemittah fruit because its status is determined by when it is picked.

This resolution is challenged. ■

## Distinctive INSIGHT

*Say the brachah on the lulav before doing the mitzvah*

כל המצוות כולן מברך עליהן עובר לעשייתן וכו'

The rule is that a brachah for a mitzvah must be pronounced before the mitzvah is fulfilled. In regard to lulav and esrog specifically, Tosafos notes a problem. Before picking up the lulav and esrog, with the specimens laying on the table before him, the mitzvah is not considered imminent, and it is too early to say the brachah. However, once the lulav and esrog is taken, the mitzvah of ולקחתם is complete. How, then, is this mitzvah to be done?

Tosafos (ד"ה עובר לעשייתן) suggests three methods whereby the brachah for lulav and esrog might be pronounced before the mitzvah is fulfilled. One suggestion is to pick up the lulav only, and to say the brachah at that point, before taking the esrog. Once he has taken the lulav, the mitzvah is underway, but the mitzvah is only complete when all four מינים are in one's hands. This, then, is the time to recite the brachah.

The second solution considers the halachah that the mitzvah is only valid when all four items are oriented in the direction of how they grow. The suggestion, therefore, is to pick up all four species, but to hold the esrog upside down. Once holding them, the brachah may be said, but the mitzvah is yet to be completed until the esrog is turned upright.

The third and final method is to pick up the four species, but to consciously think not to fulfill the mitzvah. Although there is an opinion that mitzvos do not have to be done with intention, nevertheless, when having contrary intent—to not fulfill the mitzvah—the mitzvah has certainly not been executed. The brachah can now be said, and the person will then intend for the mitzvah to commence. Accordingly, the brachah has preceded the fulfillment of the mitzvah.

Shulchan Aruch (O.C. 651:5) cites only the first two suggestions of Tosafos, but he omits the third solution. Ta"z (#5) explains that the first two solutions which Tosafos gives are clear guidelines of how to act. One is to recite the brachah after picking up the lulav only, and the second method is say it while holding the esrog upside down. Everyone can remember to follow such procedures. The third method, however, hinges on one's thought and intents. Although Shulchan Aruch agrees that this method works, it is a method where a person might not remember precisely what to think and when to change his intent. It is therefore not a recommended procedure, and he therefore omits it.

Mishnah Berura (ibid. #25) notes that the Gr"a holds that the best method is, in fact, the third suggestion. ■

# HALACHAH Highlight

## Making the Brachah Before the Mitzvah

אבל לפנינו מצוה לברך דאמר ר"י אמר שמואל כל המצוות כולן מברך עליהן עובר לעשייתן

*But beforehand [Hallel] there is a mitzvah to make a brachah as R' Yehudah in the name of Shmuel taught all mitzvos require the brachah to be recited before they are performed.*

Tosafos<sup>1</sup> notes that the requirement to recite a brachah before performing the mitzvah presents a difficulty for the mitzvah of lulav. On the one hand one should make the brachah before taking the lulav because once the lulav and esrog have been lifted the mitzvah has been fulfilled<sup>2</sup>. On the other hand, making the brachah while the lulav and esrog are in their packaging is too early to be considered before the mitzvah.

Tosafos offers four suggestions for this quandary. 1) The brachah could be recited while one is holding the lulav but not the esrog. 2) One could hold the lulav and the esrog but one of them should be held upside down until after the brachah. 3) Hold both the lulav and the esrog in their normal fashion but have in mind to not fulfill the mitzvah until after the brachah is recited. 4) Since the mitzvah is not completed until after the shaking of the lulav, one could make the brachah after one has picked them up as long as he did not finish shaking them. Shulchan Aruch<sup>3</sup> rules that one should either make the brachah before taking the esrog or one should make the brachah while holding the esrog upside down. Mishnah Berurah<sup>4</sup> cites the option to hold

# REVIEW and Remember

1. Which brachah of Hallel is subject to local custom?  
-----
2. What are the two ways to obtain an esrog during shemittah without purchasing the esrog?  
-----
3. What quantity of produce is one permitted to gather during shemittah?  
-----
4. In what three ways is an esrog treated like a tree?  
-----

the species but to have in mind to not fulfill the brachah and notes that the Vilna Gaon held that this was the best practice.

Another related issue is which of the two, the lulav and the esrog, should be lifted first. According to some<sup>5</sup>, one should lift the esrog first and then the lulav since esrog is mentioned first in the Torah. Others<sup>6</sup> prefer to take the lulav and then the esrog since the brachah mentions the lulav explicitly. ■

1. תוס' לט ד"ה עובר
2. גמ' לקמן מב מדאגביה נפק ביה
3. אר"ח סי' תרנ"א סע' ה'
4. מ"ב שם ס"ק כ"ה
5. ע' באר היטב שם סק"ח שמביא כן ממג"א סק"ח בשם המטה משה והשל"ה
6. ע' שערי תשובה שם סק"ד וע"ע בספר ארבעת המינים השלם מילואים לדיני נטילת לולב אות ג' ■

# STORIES Off the Daf

## Unbending pride

כל המצוות כולן מברך עליהן עובר לעשייתן ומאי משמע דהאי עובר לישראל דאקדומי הוא

We find on today's daf the general rule that blessings are to be said before performing mitzvos, and not afterward. The brachah is our expression of gratitude to Hashem for His kindness in giving us the mitzvah. Making a blessing is the natural outgrowth of taking joy and pride in the mitzvos that we do.

Rambam, zt"l, was born in Cordoba, Spain. Before his bar mitzvah, the city was conquered by the "Almohadim," a fanatically religious Moslem sect that believed in proselytizing by the sword and eventually ruled over Spain and North Africa. Rambam's

family fled their onslaught and embarked on a long exile, finally finding refuge in Fez, Morocco. Although the Almohadim also controlled this city, in Fez they allowed Jews to remain without official recognition.

One Sukkos, Rambam was proudly walking with his arba minim to synagogue and his unusually buoyant demeanor attracted the notice of a passing Moslem officer.

"Why are you walking with leaves and branches like a crazy man?" he asked.

Rambam immediately responded, "You could call a person who throws stones crazy, but there is nothing outlandish about fulfilling the Creator's will by taking the four species on Sukkos." With that, Rambam continued on his way.

A passing Moslem overheard his words and chided the officer, "How can you have missed his impudent reference to our own religious practices? He was obviously alluding to our custom of throwing stones in the holy city of Mecca! That infidel ought to be punished!"

The officer was so enraged that he ordered Rambam captured and killed. As soon as the search began, Rambam heard that he was a wanted man and fled with his family to Eretz Yisrael. From there, they went down to Egypt and settled outside of Cairo, where he became the gadol hador.

Like Rambam, we should be so filled with pride when we go to make our blessing on the arba minim that it is noticeable to any passerby we meet on the street! ■

