

## OVERVIEW of the Daf

### 1) Drawing lots (cont.)

Three challenges are presented against the second version of R' Yannai's opinion. According to the second version R' Yannai maintains that both R' Yehudah and R' Nechemya agree that drawing the lots is essential.

### 2) The confession over the goat sent to Azazel

The Gemara elaborates on an earlier recorded dispute between Tanna Kamma and R' Shimon whether the confession said over the goat sent to Azazel is essential.

A Baraisa is cited that records a dispute between R' Yehudah and R' Shimon concerning how long the goat sent to Azazel must remain alive. This dispute is understood to be related to the dispute whether the confession over the goat sent to Azazel is essential.

This dispute is related to another dispute regarding the meaning of the word **לכפר**. According to R' Yehudah it refers to atonement achieved through blood whereas according to R' Shimon it refers to atonement achieved by words, i.e. confession.

### 3) Drawing lots (cont.)

The Gemara attempts to demonstrate that according to all Tannaim the lottery is not essential.

Rava rejects the proof.

The Gemara attempts to demonstrate that according to all Tannaim the lottery is essential.

Rava rejects the proof.

The Gemara finally demonstrates that according to R' Yehudah the lottery is essential, which refutes the opinion that stated that the lottery is not essential. ■

## REVIEW and Remember

1. According to R' Shimon, what happens when one of the goats dies after the lottery?  
\_\_\_\_\_
2. Explain the phrase **פר מעכב את השעיר**.  
\_\_\_\_\_
3. Why did R' Akiva not permit the Kohen Gadol to change the outcome of the lottery?  
\_\_\_\_\_
4. What could lead one to think that a verbal designation will determine which goat will be offered as a chatas?  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Distinctive INSIGHT

*Can the lot of the left hand be switched to the right?*

עלה בשמאל מהו שיחזור לימין. אמר להן אל תתנו מקום לצדוקים

The Gemara conducts a discussion to determine whether the procedure of **הגרלה** is critical in order to designate the status of each goat, or whether the role of each goat can be declared without the lottery. As a proof, the Gemara cites a query presented to Rabbi Akiva by his student. If the lot for Hashem came into the left hand of the Kohen Gadol, can he switch it over to his right hand? This question indicates that the lot coming into the left hand of the Kohen is obviously not a determining factor, for if it was, the status of the goat would have already been finalized, and handing the lot into the right hand would be futile.

The **ארי** and **רש"ש** both note that this question posed to Rabbi Akiva does not seem to prove that **הגרלה** is critical. Even the opinion that the lottery procedure is not essential still holds that once it is done, the choosing of the lots has an effect. Therefore, according to both opinions, once the lot for Hashem has been taken by the left hand, the goat on the left has that designation.

**דובב מישרים** (3:#104) inquires about the very nature of the lottery. It might be a manner of sanctification, similar to verbal **קידוש** in general, and this would mean that a person could potentially ask for a release from the effects of the procedure (**שאילה**). In fact, this may be the perspective of the one who holds that **הגרלה** is not critical. This procedure can be done by lots or by verbal designation.

Or, it might be a form of clarification (**בירור**). Once the lot enters into the respective hand, this is a form of a revelation that this particular goat is for Hashem or that it is for Azazel. If this is the case, no release (**שאילה**) would be allowed, because we are not dealing with a case of a personal declaration of **קדושה**.

This can resolve the question of the **ארי**. The query asked from Rabbi Akiva was that if the **הגרלה** is not **מעכב**, and we are dealing with a form of being **מקדיש**, can the lot from the left hand be placed into the right? This should depend on the mind set of the kohen, and his intention that this lot would come in his right hand. ■

Today's Daf Digest is dedicated  
By the Bider families  
in memory of their mother and grandmother  
**מרת חנה בת ר' זאב וואלף, ע"ה**

# HALACHAH Highlight

## The custom to engage in סגולות

שאלו תלמידיו את ר"ע וכו' עלה הגורל בשמאל מהו שיחזירו לו ולשעירו לימין. אמר להן אל תתנו מקום לצדוקים לרדות

The students asked R' Akiva ... If the lot appears in [the Kohen Gadol's] left hand can he switch the lot and the goat to the right? He responded that one is not permitted to give the Tzedukim an opportunity to be domineering.

Meiri<sup>1</sup> explains that although switching the goat and the lot from the left to the right does not invalidate the service, nonetheless it should not be done. The reason for this caution is the concern that the Tzedukim would claim that our activities are based upon witchcraft.

The basis for the students' suggestion is that there are two benefits when the lot for the goat to be brought as a korban appears in the Kohen Gadol's right hand. The first is that it is a sign of Divine Providence and favor when the lottery falls on the right. [This is evident from the Gemara's earlier statement (לט) that during the forty years leading up to the destruction of the Beis HaMikdash the lottery ended up in the Kohen Gadol's left hand.] The second benefit is that mitzvos performed with the right hand<sup>2</sup> carry a greater significance than mitzvos performed with the left hand. The students therefore asked that when the lottery ends up in

the left hand of the Kohen Gadol although they were not privileged to Divine Providence and favor, but perhaps it should be switched to the right hand to give the mitzvah greater significance. To this, R' Akiva replied that the Tzedukim will suspect us of doing witchcraft<sup>3</sup> and therefore it is not an option. This is similar to the prohibition mentioned by the Rishonim<sup>4</sup> to engage in nostrums (סגולות). Therefore, the practice of hanging names of people who are looking for a shiduch on a tree should not be followed<sup>5</sup>; rather one should beseech<sup>6</sup> Hashem for assistance. ■

1. מאירי ד"ה מכיון. ורש"י פירש שהצדוקים יחשדו שעושים הכל כרצונם
2. כדאשכחן בכמה מקומות שימין חשוב כבשבת דף ס"א א' ובד"מ באו"ח ס"ב סק"א, ועי' לעיל בדף ל"ג בדברינו בדין דכל פינות שאתה פונה שיהיו דרך ימין. וצריך להחזיק את החפץ של מצוה או המאכל בשעת ברכה בימין, עי' סוכה מ"ה, ושו"ע או"ח תרנ"א, וברכות דף מ"ג ושו"ע או"ח סימן ר"ו ס"ד. ואכמ"ל
3. ומסבואר בלשון המאירי שע"ז כבר יחשדו כן בכל מעשיהם
4. עי' רמב"ם מורה נבוכים ח"ג סל"ז, ושו"ת הרשב"א ח"א סימן תי"ג. וגם לבאר משה ח"ח סל"ו שהתיר לחשוש למה שאומרים הזקנות שתינוק לא יראה במראה לפני גי'ל שנה ושלא לעבור מע"ג ראש ע"ש, מ"מ לכאן יודה שאין לעשות מעשה בדברים חדשים שלא קיבלנו מדורות הקודמים. וגם בט"ז גר"א ופת"ש יו"ד קע"ח ס"ג, משמע דלא כבאר משה, וגם עי' ברשב"א הנ"ל ובמאירי בחולין צ"ה ע"ב ד"ה ככבר, ושבת דף ס"ז ע"א, ובש"ג ע"ז דף ט' ע"א. ואכמ"ל
5. כן הורה מו"ר משה הלברשטם זצ"ל וכן שמעתי בשם עוד גדולים. וע"ע במ"ב סימן ש"א ס"ק ק"ו. ודו"ק. ועי' שו"ת מנחת יצחק (ח"ו סימן פ' בד"ה ועוד אני, ובד"ה והנה ראיתי) שהחמיר לכתחילה אפילו כשיש ספק שמא מועיל
6. וכמש"כ בברכות ח' ע"א על זאת יתפלל וכו' לעת מצוא זו אשה ■

# STORIES Off the Daf

## Turn away from evil, and do good...

עד מתי יהיה זקוק לעמוד חי? עד שעת מתן דמו של חברו

Our Gemara implies that the sprinkling of the blood of the goat that is dedicated לה must precede the confession over the scapegoat before it is sent forth. The Shem MiShmuel, zt"l, explains that the goat "for Hashem" represents the elevation of the good within ourselves, and the scapegoat represents rejection of the negative inside. That is why the service of the goat for Hashem must be done before the service of the scapegoat is begun. Although the verse says that we

are first to "turn from evil" and only then "do good," a danger lies in the waiting. If we delay doing good until we are purified of all evil, we are likely to never do any good at all! Often, the most effective method for rejecting the bad is by totally immersing ourselves in doing good. And the very best way to ensure that we really "turn away from evil," is by immersing ourselves in the ultimate good: Torah study that is equal to all of the other mitzvos combined!

On the last day of the Sha'agas Aryeh, zt"l, word spread that he was near the end. The Beis Din of Metz and other prominent members of the community sat at his bedside, so that they could be present at the passing of the sage.

The Sha'agas Aryeh lay on the bed completely depleted, but from time to time he would request another tractate from his attendant, as he descended deeper and deeper into the sugyas hashas. Eventually, one of the communal heads told the attendant to hand the Rav a copy of Me'ever Yabok so that he could confess and say the proper prayers before it was too late.

The Rav handed the book back to his attendant with a face shining with inner fulfillment and joy.

He said, "Not only did I never have the time to sin...I didn't even have time to consider sinning! I was always completely occupied with learning. When would I have had the time to transgress?" ■