

OVERVIEW of the Daf

1) Multiple sets of animals used for the Yom Kippur service (cont.)

R' Nachman defends his position that in the event additional sets of animals are needed for the Yom Kippur service only one goat will be sent off the cliff.

2) Which Azazel goat is sent

A dispute is recorded regarding which of potentially multiple goats will actually be sent to Azazel. According to R' Pappi it is the first goat whereas according to R' Shimi it is the last one.

The Gemara identifies the rationale behind each position.

הדרן עלך הוציאו לו

3) MISHNAH: The Mishnah describes the characteristics that were sought when purchasing the pair of goats. The halachos are presented regarding what to do when one of the goats dies or the blood is spilled.

4) Similar goats

A Baraisa and ensuing discussion identify the sources that relate to the halachos regarding the similarities between the two goats.

A similar discussion is recorded regarding the lambs for the metzora and the birds for the metzora.

The Gemara suggests that the same halachah should be true for the lambs needed for the daily Korban Tamid.

The Gemara explains that the word שנים in the context of the Korban Tamid is needed for another exposi-

(Continued on page 2)

Distinctive INSIGHT

The goats must be similar in every way

שני שעירי יום הכפורים מצותן שיהיו שניהן שוים במראה ובקומה ובדמים

The Rishonim explain the requirement that the two goats of Yom Kippur be essentially identical. Initially, this halachah seems impossible to fulfill. The Gemara (Sanhedrin 71a) presents an opinion that the two parents of a recalcitrant son (בן סורר ומורה) be similar in voice, appearance and height. To this, the Gemara notes that according to this view, the constraints of בן סורר ומורה will never be satisfied because it is impossible that the two parents ever share all these features in common. Based upon this Gemara, Tosafos Yeshanim asks how our Mishnah could ever expect us to find two goats which are similar in appearance, height and value. He answers that the Gemara in Sanhedrin is specifically noting that two human beings would never be found who are identical, but two goats may, in fact, be essentially identical. Sfas Emes adds that the two goats may be identical twins, having been born from the same mother, but this is impossible by the parents of the recalcitrant son. Sfas Emes concludes that this would mean, however, that the two goats for Yom Kippur always be identical twins. גבורת ארי also makes this observation, but he mentions that we do not find that the commentators require the degree of similarity to be so exacting.

Tosafos HaRosh and Ritva also explain that in general, two animals can be found which are basically the same. This is very difficult to find by people, and in regard to the parents of the בן סורר ומורה, where one is the mother and the other the father, it is not feasible for them to be similar.

Ritva concludes by asking from the Yerushalmi which states that even two kernels of wheat are never exactly the same. How, then, can we ever expect to find two goats which are identical? Therefore, Ritva explains that we do not expect these goats to be literally identical. We simply want to find two animals which are as similar as possible. He brings a proof to this from Rashi, who explains, "the appearance of the goats should be the same, meaning that they should both be white or both be black." We see that the similarity does not have to be extensive and absolute.

REVIEW and Remember

- How do we know that according to R' Yosi that it is a mitzvah to use the first animal which was lost but now found?
- In what way should the two goats be similar?
- What word is used to teach that pairs of birds and animals must be similar?
- Why is there liability for slaughtering the goats before the lottery was drawn?

HALACHAH Highlight

Choosing between two Shofar blowers

המפריש פסחו ואבד והפריש אחר תחתיו ואחר כך נמצא הראשון והרי שניהן עומדין אי זה מהן שירצה יקריב דברי חכמים רבי יוסי אומר מצוה בראשון ואם היה שני מובחר ממנו יביאנו

One who designates his Pesach and it became lost and he designates another and then the first one is found – whichever one he wants he may offer, these are the words of Chachamim. R' Yosi says that the mitzvah is to offer the first animal, but if the second is nicer than the other, it should be offered.

One time the person who regularly served as the ba'al tokeah to blow the shofar for Rosh HaShanah became ill and another person was chosen who was to serve in his place. Before Rosh HaShanah arrived the regular ba'al tokeah recovered and expressed his wish to be able to blow shofar for the community. The replacement ba'al tokeah, however, claimed that he should have the right to blow shofar since he was appointed to blow and had not become disqualified. The Panim Me'iros¹ wrote that the issue hinged upon the dispute between R' Yosi and Chachamim in our Gemara regarding the following case. A person set aside a lamb for the Korban Pesach and after that animal became lost a replacement animal was chosen. After midday on Erev Pesach the first lamb was found and both animals were now available for use. According to Chachamim, the owner can choose to offer either lamb, but R' Yosi maintains that the original should be offered. In our case as well, explains Rav Eisenstadt, it would seem that there

(Overview...Continued from page 1)

tion. However, the lambs brought as part of the Korban Mussaf must, indeed, be similar.

5) Slaughtering the goats outside the Azarah

A Baraisa presents the different laws related to slaughtering the Yom Kippur goats outside of the Azarah.

R' Chisda explains the reason there is liability for slaughtering the goats before the lottery was drawn.

This explanation is unsuccessfully challenged.

Ravina infers another halachah based on R' Chisda's explanation. ■

will be a dispute between Chachamim and R' Meir. Because Rambam² rules like Chachamim, the community may choose whichever ba'al tokeah they want.

The Panim Me'iros then suggests that Chachamim may agree in our case that the original ba'al tokeah should be chosen. The reason is because in our Gemara the time the obligation began was after midday on Erev Pesach, and at that moment only the second lamb was available, thus giving it an advantage. In our case, however, when the obligation to blow the shofar arrives the original candidate was once again available, and thus the replacement loses his advantage. Therefore, one could assert that even Chachamim would agree that the first ba'al tokeah should be chosen.³ ■

1. שו"ת פנים מאירות ה"ב סי' קכ"ו

2. פ"ד מהל' קרבן פסח ה"ו

3. ראה עוד על ענין זו בשו"ת תורה לשמה בענין מזוזות ובשו"ת משנה

הלכות ח"א סי' תקל"א בענין הזמנת שמן לנרות חנוכה ■

STORIES Off the Daf

Free to choose

שני שעירי יום הכיפורים מצותן שיהיו שניהן שוין במראה ובקומה ובדמים ובלקחתן כאחד

Rav Hirsch, zt"l, explains that there is a particular significance to the fact that the two goats are to be similar in every possible way. They are exactly parallel to one another until they part ways so dramatically at the threshold of the Beis Hamikdash. The one designated for Hashem is slaughtered by the sharp cut of the Sanctuary's knife, but its essence is then gathered in the holy vessels so it can gain admission to the Kodosh Kodoshim. The other remains untouched,

and it leaves the premises of the Sanctuary intact. Its escape is only temporary, however. Soon enough, it is sent out into the wild which symbolizes the life lived for selfish and material ends, and there it comes to an undignified end, cast away into the abyss.

Similarly, each one of us has the power to choose—either attachment to Hashem by resisting all internal and external temptations to sin, or the distancing from Him that is the natural outcome of a descent into an unbridled material existence. The path any of us take is not predetermined. Neither our physical qualities (מראה), our social standing (קומה), our wealth (דמים), nor the surrounding circumstances at the moment of choosing (לקיחה) forces us in one direction or the other. Whether we

head toward Hashem or the other way, the choice is always ours.

Once someone asked Rebbe Nachman of Breslov, zt"l, "How does free will work?"

The Rebbe answered in a seemingly simple way. "If you want, you do. And if you don't, you don't!"

The compiler added: "I recorded this seemingly simple exchange because many are very confused about just this point. They mistakenly think that just because they have certain habits that are deeply ingrained, they have lost their free will over these problematic areas. But we see from Rebbe Nachman's answer the simple and straightforward truth. We always have the freedom to choose at the moment that the options are laid before us. What we want, we do!" ■